

Antiquity

<http://journals.cambridge.org/AQY>

Additional services for **Antiquity**:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



Michel Barbaza. *Les Trois Bergers. Du conte perdu au mythe retrouvé. Pour une anthropologie de l'art rupestre saharien.* 2015. 270 pages, 206 colour and b&w illustrations. Toulouse: Presses Universitaires du Midi; 978-2-8107-0335-7 hardback €35.

Paul G. Bahn

Antiquity / Volume 89 / Issue 347 / October 2015, pp 1251 - 1253

DOI: 10.15184/aqy.2015.116, Published online: 09 October 2015

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0003598X15001167

How to cite this article:

Paul G. Bahn (2015). Antiquity, 89, pp 1251-1253 doi:10.15184/aqy.2015.116

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

This well-presented volume is divided into three parts, offering a logical narrative within which the maritime thesis is developed. Part I launches the adventure with three chapters introducing the key themes and providing a general archaeological context for Bronze Age Scandinavia and the region of Bohuslän. In Part II we embark upon a detailed exploration of the evidence for shoreline displacement. This is considered in relation to specific rock art locales, which are digitally modelled using refined topographical measurements (made by the author), to reconstruct detailed Bronze Age seascapes. Here, the thorny issue of rock art dating is tackled in relation to these revised shorelines. The retreating water neatly provides maximum dates for the creation of carvings placed at various altitudes along a curve produced by plotting date against sea level: the lower the carving, the later the date at which it could have been placed on the exposed rock. In Chapter 7, Ling compares accepted typological chronologies (and specifically that of Fleming Kaul) with those indicated by the new shoreline analysis to produce a refined scheme.

In Part III, Ling develops his arguments for the role of rock art within maritime ideologies and activities. The heavily theoretical Chapter 9 leads into a comprehensive analysis of ship motifs and other sea-related imagery in Chapter 10. Social organisations, practices and influences on Bronze Age communities are comprehensively explored in Chapter 11, specifically as they relate to conditions leading to the creation of rock art. A further chapter extends the analysis to the concept of 'transition', both within the maritime zone and in relation to those inland rock art panels that do not have a physical connection with the sea. An appendix provides a valuable gazetteer of the sites covered by the study, with their altitudes and assigned chronological period.

This is a well-produced and extensively illustrated volume, although the quality of the maps varies. A simple diagram to illustrate the changing sea level through the prehistoric period would also have been useful. It is generally well written although extensive citations spoil the flow in places, and a few editing niggles remain from the original text: minor typos, the occasional use of 'man' rather than 'human' and the over-use of the term 'praxis'. In a dissertation of this nature a degree of repetition is perhaps inevitable and, indeed, sometimes useful, but the re-stating of the primary thesis with every argument was unnecessary.

The summary provided in Chapter 13 will, however, be of great value for rapid reference to a volume that should be required reading for all scholars of rock art.

This study systematically interprets the maritime rock art of Bohuslän in a very persuasive way. Sophisticated theoretical explorations are combined with meticulous field measurements and analysis; the resulting conclusions are well grounded in the available evidence. The work represents a significant advance in our understanding of these seafaring communities and their relationships with the maritime rock art motifs in this particular region of Sweden. The value of incorporating rock art (with its fixed position in the landscape) into the wider archaeological analysis is clearly demonstrated, and amplified by the luxury of a relatively refined chronology. In this respect, the study is extremely successful—in some other respects, however, it is also somewhat restricted. Other parts of Scandinavia are only briefly considered and there are passing references to studies in Britain, but what are the implications for communities that produced rock art elsewhere? How might non-maritime and abstract motifs fit within Ling's scheme? Some mention is made of the ubiquitous cup mark, but it is unclear how this might relate to the other images present. These are questions for future studies.

Since the initial publication of this work, its key concepts have become familiar to many rock art researchers. It is a testament to the clarity and strength of the evidence presented that the ideas advanced are now generally acknowledged, widely cited and have provided the impetus for other studies. This republication will surely elevate Swedish rock art still further, increasing its visibility and perhaps changing the perceptions of a wider audience; no doubt it will inspire new travellers to launch their own voyages of discovery.

KATE SHARPE
Department of Archaeology,
Durham University, UK
(Email: kate.sharpe@durham.ac.uk)

MICHEL BARBAZA. *Les Trois Bergers. Du conte perdu au mythe retrouvé. Pour une anthropologie de l'art rupestre saharien*. 2015. 270 pages, 206 colour and b&cw illustrations. Toulouse: Presses Universitaires du Midi; 978-2-8107-0335-7 hardback €35.

© Antiquity Publications Ltd, 2015



There is a vast literature on Saharan rock art, including many outstanding and beautifully illustrated books. With *Les Trois Bergers*, Barbaza presents not

just a book but an ambitious attempt to establish an “anthropology of Saharan rock art” (p. 16), combining archaeology, palaeoecology, palaeoethnology and ethnography in pursuit of an interpretation of rock art based on mythology. Does it succeed?

When the ‘shamanic’ red herring was slapped onto rock art studies in the 1990s, some of that theory’s adherents went so far as to deny that *any* rock art depicted mythology. For example, Whitley (1994) stated that the rock art of the North American West “does not depict myths or their principal actors; indeed, the art has no direct connection with mythology whatsoever”. Such a claim was obviously indefensible. Barbaza, however, has gone the other way, asserting in the first sentence of the book that the great majority of rock art depicts ancient mythological tales; later passages claim that all rock art is the graphic expression of myths. This is a welcome contrast to the previous view, and almost certainly closer to the truth, but nevertheless seems equally dogmatic and unjustified, especially in an area such as the Sahara where we have no ethnographic support for any interpretations of its prehistoric rock art.

One problem here is that, despite the many citations of the work of Lévi-Strauss and others, the approach taken is insufficiently anthropological—a problem identified in another recent, similarly flawed book on rock art (cited approvingly on p. 16) of which a different reviewer has observed that “neither of the authors is trained as an anthropologist. Both specialize in rock art, and as such their forays into ethnography lack depth and theoretical grounding” (Kelly 2014: 638).

There are a number of problems with the approach adopted in this book: for example, “narrative” is equated with “mythological” (p. 19), and yet it is claimed that Saharan rock art is an exceptional resource for the study of everyday life (p. 236). Barbaza criticises those who choose a myth and look for evidence in rock art to support it; he, instead, seeks (Pan-African) regularities in compositions and

forms, and deduces information from them about their nature and functions. In practice, however, it is hard to see the difference between these approaches. “Sacrifice”, “dances” and even “ritual dances” are discussed as important mythological subjects, but it is not made clear how these can be safely identified in rock art. Another issue is that only a few of the rock art recordings in the book have been produced by the author—for the vast majority of illustrations he relies on tracings by others, and the accuracy and completeness of these recordings are often uncertain.

One of the book’s major problems is its lack of organisation. There are no chapters, rather it is divided into four parts: ‘For a multidisciplinary approach to Saharan prehistoric art’, ‘Seeking meaning’, ‘Tales in fragments: unity and variability of a few essential themes’ and ‘The myth rediscovered’. Each of these is filled with sub-sections and the text moves from topic to topic without apparent structure or sequence. To give a couple of examples: the important topic of chronology suddenly appears (p. 78) *only* to be followed directly by a section on the perspective and psychology of art, and a section on “peace or war” (p. 224) introduces a series of scenes depicting wild and domestic animals together. This problem of structure is amplified by the lack of an index; in this regard, the author has not been well served by the publisher. (On a related note, sections of text on pp. 196 and 197 are on the wrong pages, disrupting the flow.) Combined, the confusion of argument and lack of structure make this book difficult to follow. This situation is reflected in the final three pages of the volume, entitled ‘Towards an anthropology of rock art’—even here there is no clear statement of what is proposed.

Where the book’s striking and enigmatic title, “The Three Shepherds”, is concerned, Barbaza has attached some importance to trios of humans in a small series of sites and panels, yet they occupy only a brief part of the book (pp. 156–67), and are so varied in appearance, shape and size that it is hard to understand why they have been grouped together. Some are indeed with sheep, but others are with cows and some are “meeting someone”—i.e. they are four! To be fair, the many problems and uncertainties involved in any interpretation of prehistoric rock art are discussed throughout the text—alas, most have nevertheless been ignored in the eagerness to identify the Three Shepherds myth. In doing so, Barbaza has created a myth of his own.

References

- KELLY, G. 2014. Review of 'Des images pour les dieux: art rupestre et art tribal dans le Centre de l'Inde' by J. Clottes & M. Dubey-Pathak. *Journal of Anthropological Research* 70: 637–38.
- WHITLEY, D.S. 1994. Ethnography and rock art in the Far West: some archaeological implications, in D.S. Whitley & L.L. Loendorf (ed.) *New light on old art: recent advances in hunter-gatherer rock art research* (Institute of Archaeology UCLA Monograph 36): 81–93. Los Angeles: Institute of Archaeology, University of California Los Angeles.

PAUL G. BAHN

Freelance researcher

(Email: pgbahn@anlabyrd.karoo.co.uk)

VASSOS KARAGEORGHIS & ATHANASIA KANTA. *Pyla-Kokkinokremos: a late 13th century BC fortified settlement in Cyprus. Excavations 2010–2011* (Studies in Mediterranean Archaeology 141). 2014. xxvi+279 pages, numerous b&w illustrations, 11 tables. Uppsala: Åströms; 978-91-981535-0-7 hardback €80.



This monograph presents the results of fieldwork undertaken in 2011 and 2012 at the important Late Bronze Age settlement of Pyla-Kokkinokremos, located on a high, rocky plateau overlooking the Bay of

Larnaca in southern Cyprus. The site is of particular significance for the light it potentially throws on the final years of the Late Bronze Age, *c.* 1200 BC—a period characterised by population movements, disruption to maritime trade networks and the collapse of major political systems throughout the East Mediterranean. The aims of the 2011–2012 excavations were twofold: firstly, to determine the layout of building complexes over the whole plateau, focusing on the area immediately to the south of excavations undertaken during the early 1980s (area II, Karageorghis & Demas 1984); secondly, to confirm that the casemate wall encircled the site and functioned as a fortification system. A further important question addressed here (Chapter 6) is the role of Pyla within the island's settlement hierarchy:

should it, as suggested by several archaeologists (Keswani 1996: 234; Steel 2004: 188; Knapp 2008: 238–39), be interpreted as a nodal point within a network of sites associated with the maritime trade of Cypriot copper, or was it a refugee site, possibly for Aegean migrants (Karageorghis & Demas 1984).

The volume clearly presents the excavation results, following the format of earlier excavations directed by Karageorghis at this and other contemporary sites. This consistency of presentation allows the reader to navigate easily through the text. In keeping with the stated aims of the project, the main focus is the architectural remains of the settlement at Pyla. Four separate building complexes were identified, each built contemporaneously and with only a single phase of occupation. The architecture, stratigraphy, construction and finds are clearly reported in Chapter 1, the detailed presentation allowing the reader to extract meaningful information for the interpretation of the use of space and the range of activities within individual buildings. Chapter 2 addresses specific architectural problems, including the nature of the casemate wall, the site's water supply and the extent of habitation. Individual architectural features are discussed in Chapter 3 and the casemate wall is contextualised within the architectural traditions of the Aegean and East Mediterranean. The picture presented in these three chapters is of a well-planned settlement. Links with Aegean architecture are highlighted; for example, the hearth in complex F (p. 116) and the casemate walls, which are compared to those of Kastrokephala (Crete) and Malthi (the Peloponnese). The latter is of particular significance for constructing narratives of the final stages of the Late Bronze Age, both because of the political relationship between Cyprus and the Hittites, as indicated in contemporary textual accounts, and because of the possible Aegean migrations to the island and the southern Levant *c.* 1200 BC. Given the absence of any detailed consideration in the chapter of Hittite casemates, it is hard for the reader to draw their own conclusions as to the significance of Pyla's casemates. Although the text highlights possible external cultural links in relation to this architecture, the discussion only hints at the 'aegeanisation' of Cyprus.

One of the challenges faced by excavators in Cyprus and the Near East is the publication of large quantities of finds in a meaningful manner. An inventory of objects is presented in Chapter 4 and there is more

© Antiquity Publications Ltd, 2015